



## Is the Science of al-Jarh wat-Ta'deel Abrogated?

Compiled by Abbaas AbuYahyaa

### **Introduction**

All Praise is due to Allaah, we praise Him, seek His aid and His Forgiveness. We seek refuge in Allaah from the evils of our souls and the evils of our actions. Whomsoever Allaah guides there is none to misguide and whomsoever Allaah misguides there is none to guide. I bear witness that there is none worthy of worship except Allaah, alone, without any partners and I bear witness that Muhammad is His servant and messenger.

This is a reply to some of the “doctors of knowledge” in primarily the Western lands who have claimed that al-Jarh wat-Ta'deel is finished and is not longer relevant to the current times – misleading the confusing the common-folk thereby, and opening the doors wide open for the Innovators and the groups and sects of Innovation!

### **The Text**

This question & answer is taken from the book entitled : ‘Al-Ajwibaa as-Sadeedah ‘ala al-Asailatee ar-Rasheedah’, p.44 - 49 the questions were put forward by Abu Ibraheem Muhammad bin Muhammad al-Aanasee al-Athree to the noble Shaykh Zayed bin Muhammas bin Hadee al-Mudkhalee - may Allaah protect him.

From amongst the Questions was the following:

There has arisen in this time those who say that the knowledge of Jarh wa Ta'deel was only placed for a specific span of time, and as for now we have no need of it, so what is your opinion regarding this, - may Allaah grant you success?

### **The Answer:**

Before beginning to answer to this question, I would like to remind you of some points which are necessary for the students of knowledge, the inheritors of the Prophets, to study and understand these points with a correct understanding:

The first point: that which has been narrated on the Salaf in connection with the importance of the Isnaad and that it is from the characteristics of this Ummah, which has distinguished characteristics differing from that of the previous nations, and this is not hidden from the one who possesses an understanding of the Deen, indeed Muhammad bin Sireen said: ‘Indeed this knowledge is from the Deen, so be-aware from whom you take your Deen from.’

And he also said: ‘No attention used to be payed to the isnaad, but when the fitnah came, they said name us your men (i.e. the names of the narrators in the isnaad) so if they were

from Ahl-ul-Sunnah their hadeeth would be accepted, and if they were from Ahl-ul-Bida' their hadeeth would be rejected.'

So I say: these two statements honour Ahl-ul-Sunnah, and clearly rebuke Ahl-ul-Bida' so may Ahl-ul-Hadeeth be delighted in every time and every place, and great praise and credibility to those who possess it, and intense pity on the Ahl-ul-Bida' from amongst the Muslims, who have had the matters reversed upon them due to their evil ways which is clear in their reviving the bida', and their aiding bida' and causing the Sunnah to die, and their hate for the people of Sunnah.

The Second point: That Jarh wa Ta'deel in every generation from time has its men, and due to their characteristics, of knowledge of the Book & the Sunnah and its sciences and whom are associated with integrity and alertness.

Imaam Malik - may Allaah be pleased with him - said: 'Indeed this is knowledge of the Deen, so pay attention from whom you take your Deen, for verily I met 70 prominent personalities, those who used to narrate, so & so said that the Messenger of Allaah said, and then he [Imaam Malik] pointed towards the Masjid of the Messenger, and said: And I did not take anything from them, and if one of them was to be put as a guard over bait ul-maal ( where they used to store the wealth ) he would indeed be trustworthy, but he would not be from the people who deal with narrations and, yet when Ibn Shihaab came to us, we would rush and crowd outside his door.'

I Say: and all of that, because Ibn Shihaab was from amongst the people of knowledge regarding narrators, and had perfection in memorizing the texts and integrity and alertness.

Before the statement of Imaam Malik: 'Mujahid said that Basheer al-Adawee came to Ibn Abbas, so Basheer began to narrate and said: 'The Messenger of Allaah said, the Messenger of Allaah said.' so Ibn Abbas did not listen to him, and did not even look towards him, so he said: 'O Ibn Abbas why is it that you do not listen to me narrate, I narrate to you on the Messenger of Allaah and you do not listen!' Ibn Abbas said: 'Verily we used to, if we heard a man say: 'the Messenger of Allaah said' we used to hasten to see him and leaned towards him with our ears so when the people started to accept from anybody & everybody, then we did not take from the people except from those whom we knew.'

The third point: The obligation of having concern with the implementation of the principle 'Tasfiyah & Tarbiyah' (purification and education) and the intent of Tasfiyah (purification) as I understand it is: the differentiating of the authentic Ahaadeeth from the weak ones, and differentiating the weak Ahaadeeth which can be strengthened from those that cannot be strengthened, and the differentiating of the Sunnah from the bida', and differentiating the 'Aqeedah of the Salaf and their knowledge based Manhajj (methodology) from from the beliefs of the Ahl-ul-Bida' and their methodology, from those who have preceeded and those of the present time, and differentiating the righteous people from the criminals, and differentiating those from whom it is necessary to take the knowledge from, and to refer

back to the Fatawa (verdicts) and they are the 'Ulama ar-Rabbaneoon (the noble scholars) who are upon the methodology of the Salaf in knowledge and action, and differentiating from those who are not, from every misguided mubtadi' (person of Bida') who couples together, inviting to his misguidance and advising the people to accept his misguidance.

As for Tarbiyah: Then the objective of this is the Tarbiyah of the individuals and the intellect with the texts of the Book and the Sunnah with the understanding of the Salaf as-Saalih - may Allaah have mercy on them. Then if the people are nurtured on the hands of their 'Ulama, to adhere to the Book of their Lord, and the authentic Sunnah of their Prophet, then they will indeed be successful with a good blessed life, and if they are nurtured by the ideas of 'thinkers' from those who have little insight into the Fiqh (understanding) of the Deen, and opinions of the people of Bida' which do not extend from the texts of the clear Sharee'ah then they oppressed them selves.....and have placed themselves on the path of destruction, and have been overtaken by sin and what an evil destiny it is.

Regarding the answer to the text of the question then I say relying upon the help and correction from Allaah Who has taught us to seek help from Him, as is mentioned in His truthful statement, **"You alone do we worship, You alone do we seek aid from."**

Indeed the statement of the questioner in the issue of knowledge of Jarh wa Ta'deel that it was only placed for a specific time which has passed and ended, and its pen has been lifted and its paper has dried and its personalities have died, then this is a mistake, and in it is clear foolishness and prevention from the eagerness of concern for the texts of the Book & the Sunnah and their sciences, and diverting the students of Sharee'ah knowledge away from looking into the narrators of the Ahaadeeth and it's texts, and that is the possible danger of this, which is not hidden from the people of knowledge and the Imaams of the Deen.

The truth is inshAllaah that the knowledge of Jarh wa Ta'deel will continue and remain as long as there is knowledge and 'Ulama, and that is because generally in every period of time, there are Imaams who are qualified to give Ta'deel to whom so-ever is deserving of Ta'deel, and give Jarh to those who are deserving of Jarh, due to the evidence of the saying of the Prophet - sallaAllaahu alayhi wa sallam - : 'There will always continue to be a group from my Ummah upright with the command of Allaah, they will not be harmed by those who abandon them, nor by those who oppose them until the command of Allaah comes and they are (thairoon) manifest to the people.'

And in another narration: 'There will always continue to be a group from my Ummah firm on the command of Allaah, it will not be harmed by whom so-ever opposes it.'

Indeed a large group from the scholars said: if this group is not the people of hadeeth then we do not know who they are, and the people of hadeeth in reality are those who are acquainted with Asaneed and its texts from its authenticity and weaknesses, and acceptance of hadeeth and rejection, and the reasons for acceptance of the hadeeth and

the reasons for rejection of hadeeth, and other aspects of research into the sciences of hadeeth which are inscribed in its books, then also, there exists today and before today and after today 'Ulama who have authorization from their Shaykhs with Asaaneed (chains of narrations) connecting up to the Prophet, so you see them narrating the six mother books of hadeeth, every book with a connected chain of narration, and this is firm proof of the existence of the knowledge of Jarh wa Ta'deel in this time and after this time.

Perhaps Allaah discloses something to one who comes later from the people of knowledge, with regards to that which is connected to the topic of Jarh wa Ta'deel, something which could have been obscure to someone before him, even if the period between them amounted to generations, and this matter is acceptable, however it does not diminish anything from the worth of the predecessors, nor is it belittling them, and what is necessary to be brought to attention is that both Jarh wa Ta'deel occurs in narrating information on other people, so the one narrating here, is either trustworthy or is disamed as it occurs in testifications regarding wealth and honor and blood, this is what is clear to me, and I have mentioned this in a summarized form, and Allaah knows best.

The best that we can say about those who say that the issue of Jarh wa Ta'deel has finished and that its narrators have died many years ago, is that they have looked into the books that have been authored in this specialisation, and their numerous numbers, and various qualities in view of their explanations, and some being medium sized and some being abridged, and they have emphatically asserted the absence of what is called Jarh wa Ta'deel in this time and the absence of its people, as they have emphatically asserted the absence of the need of the people for anything of the science of Jarh wa Ta'deel, and Allaah knows best." End of answer.

The same question was put forward to Shaykh Falh al-Harbee - may Allaah protect him-who is one of the scholars of Madinah.

**His Answer:** 'This is from the methodology of the Khawaarij of new, let us say for the sake of argument, that we put the principles of Jarh wa Ta'deel aside, now if a man comes to propose for your daughter's hand in marriage, will you not ask? will you not inquire to his status? Is he a good man? Is he honest? This is what the principles of Jarh wa Ta'deel are!'

From one of the many beneficial sittings in the house of the Shaykh between the year 1419/1420a.h.